



This is “Appendix A: Peer Review Sheets”, chapter 10 from the book [Creating Literary Analysis \(index.html\)](#) (v. 1.0).

This book is licensed under a [Creative Commons by-nc-sa 3.0](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/) license. See the license for more details, but that basically means you can share this book as long as you credit the author (but see below), don't make money from it, and do make it available to everyone else under the same terms.

This content was accessible as of December 29, 2012, and it was downloaded then by [Andy Schmitz](#) (<http://lardbucket.org>) in an effort to preserve the availability of this book.

Normally, the author and publisher would be credited here. However, the publisher has asked for the customary Creative Commons attribution to the original publisher, authors, title, and book URI to be removed. Additionally, per the publisher's request, their name has been removed in some passages. More information is available on this project's [attribution page](http://2012books.lardbucket.org/attribution.html?utm_source=header).

For more information on the source of this book, or why it is available for free, please see [the project's home page](#) (<http://2012books.lardbucket.org/>). You can browse or download additional books there.

## Chapter 10

---

### Appendix A: Peer Review Sheets

A key guiding principle of *Writing about Literature through Theory* is that peer review is central to the writing process. As you compose your papers, you will want to receive feedback from your fellow students. The benefits of peer review are twofold: (1) peer review provides you with feedback on your paper, which will help you as you revise your paper; and (2) as a peer reviewer of others' papers, you develop the skills of an editor, which will help you with the revision of your own papers. In other words, participating in peer review will help you become a stronger, more confident writer.

The following peer-review guides are inspired by the work of Peter Elbow and Pat Belanoff in *Sharing and Responding*: <http://academic.evergreen.edu/s/stilsonr/Academic%20Research/Readings/elbow.htm>.

Elbow and Belanoff provide a variety of peer-review guides that you might want to consider for your class. We have chosen the organizational peer-review guide (what they call “skeleton” peer review) for each chapter in this book, but you may find other peer-review approaches work better in your class. We have added a “warrant” section to each guide to help you articulate the connections between supporting claims and overall thesis for each paper. Peter Elbow and Pat Belanoff, eds., “Summary of Ways of Responding,” in *Sharing and Responding* (New York: Random House, 1989), <http://academic.evergreen.edu/s/stilsonr/Academic%20Research/Readings/elbow.htm>.

## **10.1 Chapter 2: Close Reading**

## Organization Feedback: Outline of a Close-Reading Paper

Paper Writer's Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Peer Reviewer's Name: \_\_\_\_\_

If you are still unsure of the paper's direction (or feel the paper isn't well organized), you may want your classmates to use *organization feedback* to give you some structural/organizational ideas. By using organization feedback, the peer reviewer looks for the general overall structure of your paper.

The key to such peer review centers on the paper having clear organization and support: (1) the writer must present a clear thesis that makes a thematic claim about the literary work, and (2) the paper must then provide support for that thesis by demonstrating how the work artistically achieves that theme using psychoanalytic theory.

### Guidelines

1. Read the paper carefully to gain a **general impression**.
2. Reread the paper, concentrating on the **overall structure/organization**.
3. Create an **outline** or "**skeleton**" of the paper by doing the following:

### Thesis

Restate the writer's thesis:

Evaluate the thesis:

Describe the close-reading approach the writer uses:

### Support

Outline the points made to support the thesis by restating the main idea of each paragraph, listing the examples the writer uses in each paragraph, and describing how each paragraph relates to the thesis (i.e., supports the thesis).

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support (from Chapter 1 "Introduction: What Is Literary Theory and Why Should I Care?"):

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:

- Examples:
- Support for thesis:
- Warrant for support:

General Comments

-----

-----

-----

## **10.2 Chapter 3: Psychoanalysis**

## Organization Feedback: Outline of a Psychoanalytic Paper

Paper Writer's Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Peer Reviewer's Name: \_\_\_\_\_

If you are still unsure of the paper's direction (or feel the paper isn't well organized), you may want your classmates to use *organization feedback* to give you some structural/organizational ideas. By using organization feedback, the peer reviewer looks for the general overall structure of your paper.

The key to such peer review centers on the paper having clear organization and support: (1) the writer must present a clear thesis that makes a thematic claim about the literary work, and (2) the paper must then provide support for that thesis by demonstrating how the work artistically achieves that theme. In other words, the writer must show how the literary work under examination is an artistic and thematic well-wrought urn.

### Guidelines

1. Read the paper carefully to gain a **general impression**.
2. Reread the paper, concentrating on the **overall structure/organization**.
3. Create an **outline** or "**skeleton**" of the paper by doing the following:

### Thesis

Restate the writer's thesis:

Evaluate the thesis:

Describe the psychoanalytic approach the writer uses:

### Support

Outline the points made to support the thesis by restating the main idea of each paragraph, listing the examples the writer uses in each paragraph, and describing how each paragraph relates to the thesis (i.e., supports the thesis).



- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support (from Chapter 1 "Introduction: What Is Literary Theory and Why Should I Care?"):

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:

- Examples:
- Support for thesis:
- Warrant for support:

General Comments

-----

-----

-----

## **10.3 Chapter 4: Feminist and Gender**

## Organization Feedback: Outline of a Feminist and Gender Paper

Paper Writer's Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Peer Reviewer's Name: \_\_\_\_\_

If you are still unsure of the paper's direction (or feel the paper isn't well organized), you may want your classmates to use *organization feedback* to give you some structural/organizational ideas. By using organization feedback, the peer reviewer looks for the general overall structure of your paper.

The key to such peer review centers on the paper having clear organization and support: (1) the writer must present a clear thesis that makes a thematic claim about the literary work. and (2) the paper must then provide support for that thesis by demonstrating how the work artistically achieves that theme using feminist and/or gender theory.

### Guidelines

1. Read the paper carefully to gain a **general impression**.
2. Reread the paper, concentrating on the **overall structure/organization**.
3. Create an **outline** or "**skeleton**" of the paper by doing the following:

### Thesis

Restate the writer's thesis:

Evaluate the thesis:

Describe the feminist or gender approach the writer uses:

### Support

Outline the points made to support the thesis by restating the main idea of each paragraph, listing the examples the writer uses in each paragraph, and describing how each paragraph relates to the thesis (i.e., supports the thesis).

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support (from Chapter 1 "Introduction: What Is Literary Theory and Why Should I Care?"):

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:

- Examples:
- Support for thesis:
- Warrant for support:

-----

General Comments

-----

-----

-----

## **10.4 Chapter 5: Race and Ethnicity**

## Organization Feedback: Outline of a Race and Ethnicity Paper

Paper Writer's Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Peer Reviewer's Name: \_\_\_\_\_

If you are still unsure of the paper's direction (or feel the paper isn't well organized), you may want your classmates to use *organization feedback* to give you some structural/organizational ideas. By using organization feedback, the peer reviewer looks for the general overall structure of your paper.

The key to such peer review centers on the paper having clear organization and support: (1) the writer must present a clear thesis that makes a thematic claim about the literary work, and (2) the paper must then provide support for that thesis by demonstrating how the work artistically achieves that theme using race and ethnicity theory.

### Guidelines

1. Read the paper carefully to gain a **general impression**.
2. Reread the paper, concentrating on the **overall structure/organization**.
3. Create an **outline** or "**skeleton**" of the paper by doing the following:

### Thesis

Restate the writer's thesis:

Evaluate the thesis:

Describe the race or ethnicity approach the writer uses:

### Support

Outline the points made to support the thesis by restating the main idea of each paragraph, listing the examples the writer uses in each paragraph, and describing how each paragraph relates to the thesis (i.e., supports the thesis).



- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support (from Chapter 1 "Introduction: What Is Literary Theory and Why Should I Care?"):

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:

- Examples:
- Support for thesis:
- Warrant for support:

General Comments

-----

-----

-----

## **10.5 Chapter 6: Reader Response**

## Organization Feedback: Outline of a Reader-Response Paper

Paper Writer's Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Peer Reviewer's Name: \_\_\_\_\_

If you are still unsure of the paper's direction (or feel the paper isn't well organized), you may want your classmates to use *organization feedback* to give you some structural/organizational ideas using reader-response theory.

The key to such peer review centers on the paper having clear organization and support: (1) the writer must present a clear thesis that makes a thematic claim about the literary work, and (2) the paper must then provide support for that thesis by demonstrating how the work artistically achieves that theme. In other words, the writer must show how the literary work under examination is an artistic and thematic well-wrought urn.

### Guidelines

1. Read the paper carefully to gain a **general impression**.
2. Reread the paper, concentrating on the **overall structure/organization**.
3. Create an **outline** or "**skeleton**" of the paper by doing the following:

### Thesis

Restate the writer's thesis:

Evaluate the thesis:

Describe the reader-response approach the writer uses:

### Support

Outline the points made to support the thesis by restating the main idea of each paragraph, listing the examples the writer uses in each paragraph, and describing how each paragraph relates to the thesis (i.e., supports the thesis).

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support (from Chapter 1 "Introduction: What Is Literary Theory and Why Should I Care?"):

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:

- Examples:
- Support for thesis:
- Warrant for support:

General Comments

-----

-----

-----

## **10.6 Chapter 7: New Historical**

## Organization Feedback: Outline of a New Historical or Cultural Paper

Paper Writer's Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Peer Reviewer's Name: \_\_\_\_\_

If you are still unsure of the paper's direction (or feel the paper isn't well organized), you may want your classmates to use *organization feedback* to give you some structural/organizational ideas. By using organization feedback, the peer reviewer looks for the general overall structure of your paper.

The key to such peer review centers on the paper having clear organization and support: (1) the writer must present a clear thesis that makes a thematic claim about the literary work, and (2) the paper must then provide support for that thesis by demonstrating how the work artistically achieves that theme using historical or cultural theory.

### Guidelines

1. Read the paper carefully to gain a **general impression**.
2. Reread the paper, concentrating on the **overall structure/organization**.
3. Create an **outline** or "**skeleton**" of the paper by doing the following:

### Thesis

Restate the writer's thesis:

Evaluate the thesis:

Describe the historical or cultural approach the writer uses:

### Support

Outline the points made to support the thesis by restating the main idea of each paragraph, listing the examples the writer uses in each paragraph, and describing how each paragraph relates to the thesis (i.e., supports the thesis).



- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support (from Chapter 1 "Introduction: What Is Literary Theory and Why Should I Care?"):

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:

- Examples:
- Support for thesis:
- Warrant for support:

General Comments

-----

-----

-----

## **10.7 Chapter 8: Ecocritical**

## Organization Feedback: Outline of an Ecocritical Paper

Paper Writer's Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Peer Reviewer's Name: \_\_\_\_\_

If you are still unsure of the paper's direction (or feel the paper isn't well organized), you may want your classmates to use *organization feedback* to give you some structural/organizational ideas. By using organization feedback, the peer reviewer looks for the general overall structure of your paper.

The key to such peer review centers on the paper having clear organization and support: (1) the writer must present a clear thesis that makes a thematic claim about the literary work, and (2) the paper must then provide support for that thesis by demonstrating how the work artistically achieves that theme using ecocritical theory.

### Guidelines

1. Read the paper carefully to gain a **general impression**.
2. Reread the paper, concentrating on the **overall structure/organization**.
3. Create an **outline** or "**skeleton**" of the paper by doing the following:

### Thesis

Restate the writer's thesis:

Evaluate the thesis:

Describe the ecocritical approach the writer uses:

### Support

Outline the points made to support the thesis by restating the main idea of each paragraph, listing the examples the writer uses in each paragraph, and describing how each paragraph relates to the thesis (i.e., supports the thesis).

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support (from Chapter 1 "Introduction: What Is Literary Theory and Why Should I Care?"):

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:
  - Examples:
  - Support for thesis:
  - Warrant for support:

-----

- Main Idea:

- Examples:
- Support for thesis:
- Warrant for support:

General Comments

-----

-----

-----

## **10.8 Chapter 9: Digital Project**

## Organization Feedback: Outline of a Digital Project

Paper Writer's Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Peer Reviewer's Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Digital projects can take on a variety of forms, so peer review will be somewhat different for this unit since you will be providing feedback on a website, for example, and not a traditional paper.

### Guidelines

1. View the digital project to gain a **general impression**.
2. Now view the project again, concentrating on the **overall structure/organization**.
3. Create an **outline** or "**skeleton**" of the digital project by doing the following:

### Project's Purpose

Describe the digital project (i.e., website, research collection/archive, digital timeline, mapping of text [geospatial], other):

Describe the purpose of the digital project:

Evaluate the clarity of purpose in the project itself:

### Project's Structure

List the sections of the digital project:

- Section 1:
  - Examples:
  - Warrant for section's purpose in project:

\_\_\_\_\_



- Section 2:
  - Examples:
  - Warrant for section's purpose in project:

-----

- Section 3:
  - Examples:
  - Warrant for section's purpose in project:

-----

- Section 4:
  - Examples:
  - Warrant for section's purpose in project:

-----

- Section 5:
  - Examples:
  - Warrant for section's purpose in project:

-----

General Comments

-----

-----

-----